



# *City of Granite City*

Inspection Department 2000 Edison, Ground Floor Granite City, IL 62040 Phone:(618) 452-6218 Fax:(618) 452-6246

## *Historical & Architectural Review Commission Minutes November 22, 2011*

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Terry Pierce called the meeting of HARC to Order on Tuesday, November 22, 2011, at 5:00 PM.

### **ATTENDANCE / ROLL CALL**

Members Present were: Terry Pierce, Henry Gabriel, Paula Hagnauer, Eric Hill and Jennifer Flores. Excused absence: Kim King. Also present were: Assistant City Attorney Laura Andrews and Jon Ferry, Economic Development Director.

### **MINUTES**

A motion to approve the Minutes from the previous meeting was made by Eric Hill and seconded by Paula Hagnauer. Voice vote. All ayes. Motion carried by unanimous consent.

### **Agenda**

A motion to suspend the rules and allow Jennifer Flores to appear as Petitioner #2 was made by Paula Hagnauer and seconded by Henry Gabriel. Voice vote: 4 ayes - 1 abstain. Motion carried.

### **AGENDA**

A motion to approve the amended agenda was made by Paula Hagnauer and seconded by Terry Pierce. Voice vote. All ayes. Motion carried by unanimous consent.

**PETITIONER (1): Jennifer Wood  
Bling & Things  
1420 Niedringhaus**

The Chair announced the first Petition is a request is to establish a retail sales store at 1420 Niedringhaus Avenue. Jennifer Wood introduced herself and stated she has been a licensed cosmetologist since 1987. She was employed at Lee's Beauty (Crossroads Shopping Center) until they closed the business.

Ms. Wood presented a poster display of typical retail merchandise; items such as cosmetics, wigs, jewelry, purses, promotional and specialty items. Also shown was the proposed exterior business sign (Attachment A, available upon request). She stated the close proximity of Gateway Regional Hospital will assist cancer patients in their need for, and her expertise, in fittings for wigs.

Mike Roeder, d/b/a Mr. Contractor, the Petitioner's contractor introduced himself and stated the exterior of the building will be kept simple; garage doors to be replaced, exterior to be painted and eventually an awning may be utilized. They are presently considering a butternut squash color with maroon trim. When asked about signage, the Petitioner stated she possesses the former Lee's Beauty sign that she will use with changes to the name. The Grand Opening is planned for sometime during the first quarter of the year, around Easter.

The Chair completed the HARC Checklist of details, requirements and conditions as follows:

- a). Days and hours of operation limited to: Monday thru Saturday - 8:00 AM to 8:00 PM
- b). Signage: Appears to be within safe limits. Must be approved by the Zoning Administrator
- c). Parking: Parking Lot and Street
- d). Additional Exterior Lighting to be installed: No, use of existing exterior lighting
- e). Additional requirements: Return to Zoning Administrator with paint color and awning rendering and any exterior structural changes
- f). Dumpster required: Establishment will share with across the street business.

**MOTION** by Henry Gabriel and seconded by Eric Hill to approve the Petition and allow the business at 1420 Niedringhaus with the stipulation that any exterior structure changes, that the Commission has not been informed of, would have to be approved by the Zoning Administrator. Roll call vote. All ayes. Motion carried unanimously.

Laura Andrews explained to the Petitioner, HARC is a recommending body to the City Council and they will have the final determination at their next meeting scheduled for December 6, 2011.

**PETITION II: Jennifer Flores**  
**APO Art Gallery - 1410 Niedringhaus Avenue**

The Chair stated Commission Board Member, Jennifer Flores, has agreed to abstain from any voting on her issue being discussed this evening.

Jennifer began by stating she has been actively involved with art and mural projects in downtown Granite, specifically citing the work on graffiti alley. Recently she received a letter from Zoning Administrator, Steve Willaredt, advising that she is in violation of the guidelines of HARC by failing to appear before the Commission for approval of the mural on her building (referring to Section 15-330) and that she has until November 30, 2011, to remedy the situation.

Jennifer stated she has read through HARC Articles and Requirements and failed to find where putting up a mural on her property requires approval. She stated; firstly, if she is in violation, she will be assessed penalty fines if the mural is not removed by November 30, 2011. Secondly, the mural is more than halfway completed at a cost of thousands of dollars. The letter (Attachment B) is available upon request.

The Petitioner stated she is confused with the rationale behind the letter requiring her to obtain approval for the mural, knowing the involvement of some downtown public art projects that did not appear before HARC for approval.

Discussion followed. Laura Andrews referred to the letter from the Zoning Administrator and explained the Municipal Court procedures. The Assistant City Attorney then asked Jennifer exactly what she is petitioning.

Jennifer stated her Petition request is to: (1) be allowed to keep the mural "as is" and to continue working on it, (2) submit the artist's rendering and (3 - Nov 30<sup>th</sup> deadline) that no fines be assessed. She stated bad weather and the Thanksgiving holiday will not allow ample time to remedy the situation.

The Assistant City Attorney stated the only thing this Board can do is recommend whether or not you will be allowed to keep the mural.

Discussion followed concerning existing public art (i.e. metal sculptures and the train painting on Callis law office) and Jennifer's mural. The Commission questioned, who is the judge of good art or bad art and what will be allowable and what will not be (i.e. profanity or pornographic images)?

The Chair read the letter submitted by Ron Laboray, the former Chairman and one of the founders of HARC (Attachment C, available upon request). Mr. Laboray supports the mural citing the following reasons:

- a). The artwork is not a sign or advertisement and is on a private building.
- b). The art is not located on the front façade of the building.
- c). The artwork is painted onto a previously painted wall, not affecting the historical nature of the bldg.
- d). The artwork does not use profanity or pornographic images.
- e). The artwork adds to the eclectic, dynamic, diverse atmosphere that HARC has moved to nurture.

Ron Laboray's credentials include:

Assistant Professor  
Coordinator of Painting & Drawing  
Western Carolina University  
College of Fine & Performing Arts  
Peter Miller Gallery, Chicago, Illinois  
JK Gallery, Los Angeles, CA  
Drawing Center, New York, NY

Jon Ferry, Economic Director, stated renderings/drawings should be judged by a qualified individual, whose profession is Art. A person capable of measuring quality and has insight to decide what is acceptable art and what may not be acceptable. Jennifer explained there are varieties in graffiti and mural art and showed (from her laptop computer) some examples of art located on the Riverfront and Cherokee Street in St. Louis.

**MOTION** by Paula Hagnauer and seconded by Eric Hill to "stay" the removal of, or painting over, the existing mural. Artist's rendering to be presented at the next scheduled meeting of HARC. Roll Call vote. 4 Ayes. 1 Abstain. Motion carried.

The impact of the Zoning Administrator's letter to Jennifer Flores was placed on hold until the next meeting to be held on January 24, 2011.

Eric Hill cautioned the committee to be very careful regarding who is allowed to do art and what "art" will be allowable on wall murals. Henry Gabriel suggested an amendment to Article 15 indicating anyone who wants to paint a mural on a building has to present an artist's rendering, to be approved by HARC, and the rendering must be submitted by a person qualified in the field of art and has a reputation in the field of art. Jennifer Flores agreed to draft restrictive, defining language, with an explanation of qualifying individuals to present renderings to HARC for approval of wall art. Upon approval of the draft, the Assistant City Attorney, Laura Andrews, will incorporate the language in Article 15. No further discussion.

**REVIEW**      **George Crisp, owner**  
                  **1840 State Street**  
                  **Cindy's Collectibles**  
                  **Pat & Cindy McKinney**

Pat McKinney began by stating Mr. Crisp is in Cadet, Missouri and due to bad weather could not be here this evening. He said they have had nothing but problems with breakage of the ceramic glass (storefront) tiles. They have found nothing that will remove the old adhesive that has been there for 50 years or more.

They want to use something that looks better and is safer, similar to the blue metal used on side of the building at Krumrey's Furniture Store. Mr. McKinney stated they had to renew their lease on 19<sup>th</sup> Street for one year because the State Street location is not ready. He said he still plans to move to the State Street location, maybe in a year. The Commission asked that Cindy's Collectibles return for review on January 24, 2012, with a revised rendering and color scheme.

**NEW BUSINESS**

Motion to cancel the December 27, 2011, regularly scheduled meeting due to the holiday season was made by Eric Hill and seconded by Henry Gabriel. Voice vote. All ayes. Motion carried by unanimous consent.

**UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

None voiced.

**MOTION** to adjourn by Paula Hagnauer and seconded by Jennifer Flores. All ayes.

Respectfully submitted,

*Barbara Hawkins*

Recording Secretary, HARC

**Historical Architecture Review Committee  
Advisory Report  
November 22, 2011**

**PETITIONER (1): Jennifer Wood  
Bling & Things  
1420 Niedringhaus Avenue**

**MOTION** by Henry Gabriel and seconded by Eric Hill to allow the retail business at 1420 Niedringhaus with the stipulation that any exterior changes the Commission has not been informed of would have to be approved by the Zoning Administrator. Zoned D-1 Arts and Entertainment District.

Roll Call Vote:	Terry Pierce	Yes	Paula Hagnauer	Yes
	Henry Gabriel	Yes	Jennifer Flores	Yes
	Eric Hill	Yes		

Motion passed by unanimous consent.

---

**PETITIONER (2): Jennifer Flores  
APO Aart Gallery  
1410 Niedringhaus Avenue**

**MOTION** by Paula Hagnauer and seconded by Eric Hill to “stay” the removal of, or painting over, the existing mural. Artist rendering to be presented at next meeting.

Roll Call Vote:	Terry Pierce	Yes	Paula Hagnauer	Yes
	Henry Gabriel	Yes	Jennifer Flores	Abstain
	Eric Hill	Yes		

Motion carried.

---